

Integration of Wasaṭiyyah Values in the Curriculum at Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi

Muhammad Nur Asmawi¹, Lukman S Tahir², Mohamad Idhan³

^{1,2,3} Department of Islamic education, Postgraduate Studies, State Islamic University of Datokarama Palu, Indonesia

ABSTRACT: This research discusses integrating wasaṭiyyah values into the curriculum of modern Islamic boarding schools in Central Sulawesi. This research examines two problems, namely wasaṭiyyah values incorporated in the modern Islamic boarding school curriculum and the approach used in integrating these wasaṭiyyah values. This research uses a qualitative case study method. The data was collected through direct food observations, in-depth interviews with several informants, and document analysis. Data were analyzed using a thematic approach that focused on the main themes that emerged during data analysis. The research findings reveal that wasaṭiyyah values are integrated with both Islamic boarding schools based on the values developed by the Indonesian Ulema Council. These values include Tawassut, Tawāzun, I'tidāl, Tasāmuḥ, Musāwāh, Shūrā, Islāh, Awlawiyyah, Taṭawwur wa ibtikār, and Tahaddur. The integration process also includes other values related to the five soul values that underlie the life of the two Islamic boarding schools. Integrating wasaṭiyyah values in the two Islamic boarding schools was done through a contributive-cultural, integrated-intra-curricular, textual-additive, and contextually applicable approach. Wasaṭiyyah values are integrated into the curriculum through the Prescribed/intended curriculum, also called the core curriculum and Hidden Curriculum. Site 1 (Modern Darussalam Gontor Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso) adds the Tested curriculum type. The theoretical implication of this research is a deeper understanding of the interaction between tradition and modernity in Islamic education, especially in modern Islamic boarding schools.

KEYWORDS: Integration, wasathiyah, Islamic boarding school, curriculum

I. INTRODUCTION

An inclusive and critical educational approach is crucial in responding to radicalism, including in the Islamic boarding school curriculum context. Inclusive education enables learning that accommodates various perspectives and individual needs, preventing narrow or extreme understanding (Ainscow, 2005). Meanwhile, critical education encourages students to think analytically and reflectively about the information they receive to develop the ability to identify and evaluate radical ideas.

In the Islamic boarding school curriculum context, an inclusive and critical approach can be realized by integrating broader aspects of education, such as literacy, science, and skills, into the religious curriculum. This allows students to gain more holistic knowledge and be relevant to the needs of the times while still maintaining strong religious values. Thus, inclusive and critical education in the Islamic boarding school curriculum can effectively prevent and respond to radicalism by strengthening moderate and tolerant understanding (Ali, Afwadzi, Abdullah, & Mukmin, 2021).

Several facts from research literature support the idea that inclusive and critical education in the Islamic boarding school curriculum can be an effective strategy in preventing and responding to the phenomenon of radicalism by strengthening moderate and tolerant understanding. One relevant study is research conducted by Hasyim in "The Role of Islamic Boarding Schools in Promoting Moderate Islam: A Case Study of Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Java, Indonesia." Research finds the vital role of Islamic boarding schools in promoting moderate Islam with an inclusive and critical educational approach.

The Islamic boarding school used as a case study in this research shows that the curriculum covers broad aspects of education, such as general knowledge and a critical understanding of religious teachings, and can produce students with moderate knowledge and are tolerant of differences. Thus, this research provides empirical support for the concept that inclusive and critical education in the Islamic boarding school curriculum can effectively respond to radicalism by strengthening moderate and tolerant understanding.

Integration of Wasatiyyah Values in the Curriculum at Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi

Overcoming religious radicalism and intolerance, which gave birth to horizontal conflict, wasatiyyah became a hope as a solution to the character or principles of the religious method offered. Wasatiyyah, intended to be a solution, has universal values such as justice, equality, mercy, and balance, which are owned by the Islamic religion and have strong historical roots in the traditions of the Prophet and Companions. Such wasatiyyah can then be found in every Islamic scientific discipline, starting from the perspective of Islamic *aqidah*, moderate Islamic thought to Sufism, and can even be integrated into learning at all levels and types of educ. During implementation, referring to published research results, the integration of wasatiyyah values in Islamic boarding school curricula has experienced problems, namely: Imbalance between religious and general aspects, lack of relevance to contemporary challenges, lack of involvement in inter-religious dialogue, limited resources, power and access to wasatiyyah literature.

However, there are differences in moderation integration models in classical and modern Islamic boarding schools (Saneian, Tabataba'i-Nasab, Saeida Ardakani, & Khodadadi, 2023). Integrating religious moderation in classical Islamic boarding schools applies religious moderation from the concepts of wasatiyyah and *al-ghuluw*, taught through the *turats* books. Every interaction of students with any book in learning is oriented towards the idea of respecting each other's religions, respecting and helping each other as was exemplified by the Prophet in respecting *dhimmi* infidels. Apart from that, students are also taught the theory of preventing radicalism as preachers in society based on four schools of *fiqh*: *fiqh al-wāqī*, *fiqh al-auwlawiyyāt*, *fiqh al-alām* and *fiqh al-Maqāsid*. To promote religious moderation, the *kiai* divided the duties of the students into three groups: intellectual students focused on studying at Islamic boarding schools, *da'i* students focused on practicing Islamic *syi'ar*, and entrepreneurial students focused on improving the community's economy.

The integration of wasatiyyah values in modern Islamic boarding schools can be seen from several aspects. The first aspect in the curriculum area is that the emphasis is on market needs, namely that modern Islamic boarding schools do not only teach religious knowledge but also give students the freedom to concentrate on their own, but mastery of religion remains a necessity which allows students to have an attitude of *taṭawwur wa ibtikār*. The second aspect is that teaching staff are brought in from outside to learn how to behave moderately. By bringing in teaching staff from outside, students can have a *musāwat* attitude by respecting people of different religions, ethnicities, and social backgrounds. The third aspect is a shift in the paradigm of *jihad* in modern Islamic boarding schools from *jihad* as a war to the definition of *jihad* (Nurdin, 2016), which is adapted to current developments that allow students to have an *ishlāh* attitude.

Therefore, it is urgent to research the integration of wasatiyyah values in Central Sulawesi's modern Islamic boarding school curriculum, considering that modern Islamic boarding schools in Central Sulawesi have an essential role in building collective awareness after communal conflict. The integration of wasatiyyah values in the curriculum can strengthen value-based education, which helps produce individuals who are more tolerant and have high social awareness. It can also be a concrete step in promoting wasatiyyah discourse, which is important for facing the challenges of extremism and radicalism.

This research can also provide insight into assessing the extent to which the modern Islamic boarding school curriculum in Central Sulawesi is relevant to the needs of the times and the demands of contemporary society. Integrating wasatiyyah values can contribute to reviewing the curriculum so that it remains relevant in people's lives. By understanding how wasatiyyah values are incorporated into the curriculum, best practices can be identified that can be applied more widely to improve the quality of education in Islamic boarding schools and perhaps also in other educational institutions.

In essence, research on the integration of wasatiyyah values in the modern Islamic boarding school curriculum in Central Sulawesi is essential not only for improving the quality of Islamic education but also for strengthening social harmony and positive contributions to broader society, as well as bridging interfaith understanding, which is very important for creating an inclusive and harmonious society. This research is also essential, not only because the content offered is interesting, but also because after searching various kinds of literature that are accessible to the researcher, we have not found any particular work that has carried out an in-depth study of the integration of wasatiyyah values in the curriculum, especially on the modern Islamic boarding school website in Central Sulawesi. However, several pieces of literature are worth mentioning here because their themes are related to the theme of this research. Among them are Rabi bin Hady Umayr al Madkhaliy, *Wasathiyat al-Islam*; al-Shalabiy, *al-Wasatiyyah fi al-Qur'an al-Karim*. The literature in question discusses the wasatiyyah discourse from a different perspective and is not as focused as the wasatiyyah discourse at the focus of this research study.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Theory of Integration of Wasatiyyah Values

The theoretical basis of this research focuses on integration theory (McShane, 1973), which is the leading guide in analyzing and solving problems related to research material objects. This integration theory combines various disciplinary perspectives and approaches to obtain a comprehensive and holistic understanding. The philosophical basis for integrating values into education includes Islamic values of moderation, using the philosophy of progressivism (Silcock, 1996). The philosophy of progressivism was presented by William James, John Dewey, Hans Vaihinger, John Ferdinand Schiller, and George Santayana, who were pioneers of this philosophy. The philosophy of progressivism views that all reality, especially in life, is to survive all the challenges of human life. It must be practical to see everything from its grandeur.

Progressivism sees everything in nature as life-changing (Clancy & Holford, 2018). In this case, the ideas, opinions, and theories applied are useful. The truth about everything is change itself. Life is a self-regenerative process that continues to interact with humans. In this point of view, education is basically a process of change from ignorance to knowledge, from weak to capable, from unskilled to skilled, from unintelligent to intelligent, and so on. Progressivism views the curriculum as an experimental educational experience with an orderly plan and structure. A good curriculum is a "core curriculum" type, namely several learning experiences around general needs. The curriculum must be open to the possibility of review and improvement. The curriculum has a flexible nature that can open the possibility for education to pay attention to each student's characteristics and needs. Due to the nature of the curriculum, which is fresh, open, and can be revised, the curriculum should ideally be a curriculum that is centered on experience.

B. The Concept of Wasatiyyah Values

The term value refers to the price or value of an object or idea. Value can also be interpreted as an attribute that determines the level of importance or priority, better or less good quality, and the truth or falsity of something (Dalvi-Esfahani, Ramayah, & Rahman, 2017; Dubois & Beauvois, 2008). Antony Giddens (2006) defines values as the ideas held by a group of individuals regarding what is considered worthy, desirable, and of good value. In a sociological and anthropological context, values reflect a collective view of preferences and moral standards that serve as a reference for societal behavior and decision-making.

The meaning of wasatiyyah linguistically shows several meanings as in *Miqāyis al Lughah*: al wāw, al sīn and al ṭa' are binā' ṣaḥiḥ which reveals the meaning of العدل (justice), النصف (half) and اعدل الشيء أوسطه ووسطه. The word "وسط," according to Salaby, has two forms: difathah sīn and disukūn. The word الوسط with sukūn in sīn is zarf, meaning between. Meanwhile, fath in sīn has many adjacent meanings, namely being اسم which means two edges, something like the words وسط الحبل and قبيضت وسط الدار, the word الوسط also sometimes means صفة which means أفضل, خيرا, and خياره كوسط المرعى. The word الوسط can also mean العدل as found in the Arabic word اوسطه عدله and can also mean something that is between good and evil like the Arabic word وسط شئى أي بي نالجيد والرديء.

Al-Asfahaniy defines "wasatan" with "sawā'un," which is the middle between two limits of something, or with justice, the middle of the standard or the ordinary. "wasatan" also means guarding against being ifrāt and tafriṭ (Supardi, Kuswaya, & Ridwan, 2023). The word wasat, with various derivations, is found in the Qur'an in three places: QS.al-Baqarah (2):143, 238, and QS.al-Qalam (68):48. The term wasatiyyah has been used by various scientists in their works, including Yusuf al-Qaradawi, in the book "Islamic Awakening Between Rejection and Extremism" and "The Quranic Term Wasatiyyah and the Challenge of Global Citizenship" in the *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, Azyumardi Azra, in the book, "Indonesia, Islam, and Democracy: Dynamics in a Global Context" and the article "Moderate Islam in Indonesia: A Tradition of Tolerance and Inclusiveness" in the *Asian Journal of Social Science*, M. Quraish Shihab in the book "The insight of Al-Qur'an: Tafsir Thematic on various problems of the Ummah," Amr Khaled, in the book "The Revolution Within: The Power of the Unseen Self," John L. Esposito in the book "Islam: The Straight Path," and Nurcholish Madjid in the book "Islam, Modernity and Indonesian's."

III. METHODOLOGY

This study was conducted in two modern Islamic boarding schools in Central Sulawesi, Indonesia. Data was gathered through field observation, in-depth interviews, and written material analysis. The interviews involved two school principals and fifteen Islamic religious teachers from the schools. Data was analyzed using a thematic analysis approach, which begins with open coding, iterative coding, and finally, theoretical coding to build theoretical constructs from the data. Before analysis, the data was transcribed, and the results of the transcripts were consulted with the participants to obtain their consent (Nurdin, Scheepers, & Stockdale, 2022; Nurdin, Stockdale, & Scheepers, 2014). The data analysis used a deductive thinking technique, interpreted as a research procedure that produces deductive data from the interviews and field notes. Data analysis was conducted using thematic

Integration of Wasaṭiyyah Values in the Curriculum at Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi

analysis from Strauss and Corbin (1998). The analysis started with open, axial, and selective coding. The final result of the data analysis is themes found from the data as practiced by Nurdin (2018).

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Integrative wasaṭiyyah values in Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi.

The condition of division and conflict among Muslims has inspired Trimurti, the founders of Gontor Modern Islamic boarding school, to present a moderate educational institution that promotes ukhuwah Islamiyah as a pillar of the five souls, which has become a philosophy in their education. The principle that Trimurti adheres to as the founder of this educational institution is to stand above and for all groups. Therefore, in all its branches, Gontor Modern Islamic boarding school accommodates the needs of Muslims who wish to study at this educational institution regardless of their organizational background.

The policy of integrating the value of tawassuṭ in the curriculum can be seen in learning about the importance of the value of tawassuṭ instilled in the students of Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso through the textbook *Bidāyah al Mujtahid wa nihāyah al-muqtaṣid* by Abu Al-Walid Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Rushd. This book contains comparisons of schools of thought and is considered the best book to explain the causes of differences of opinion between scholars on every fiqh issue. Regarding this policy, the deputy director of Kulliyatul Muallimin al-Islamiyah said that, This policy is intended to integrate the value of tawassuṭ into our curriculum. By studying this book, students can understand the differences in schools of thought, opinions, and views. We hope that this understanding will help students become moderate Muslims.

Fiqh is learning how to use this book given to class V students. This policy is intended to integrate the value of tawassuṭ in the curriculum so that, through studying this book, students can understand the differences in schools of thought and debate differences in schools of thought, opinions, and views so that students can become moderate Muslims. Integrating the value of tawassuṭ into the curriculum involves giving students the freedom to discuss khilafat issues and choose opinions following appropriate arguments. One integration step is implementing morning prayers at the Jami mosque at Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso.

a. The value of tawāzun or balance

Tawāzun, as a principle of moderation in this research, was realized in the form of balance in various aspects: worldly and spiritual, material and meaningful, spirit and reason, rights and obligations, the relationship between humans and Allah and humans and other humans, balance in the use of 'aqli and naqli propositions, and balance of religious and general education. In the context of Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, the value of Tawāzun is reflected through the balance between religious education and general knowledge. This institution consistently emphasizes the importance of equality in providing attention to these two fields of study. Apart from studying Islamic teachings, students are also given a comprehensive understanding of general science, which includes various scientific disciplines to equip them with relevant knowledge and skills in social, economic, and intellectual contexts. This approach reflects the commitment of Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, to holistic development in education, where the combination of religious knowledge and general knowledge is considered an essential step in forming the character of students who have integrity and can contribute significantly to society.

Education at Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, consistently emphasizes the importance of maintaining a balance between the dimensions of spirituality and the needs of the world in forming students' character. This institution places deep emphasis on developing aspects of spirituality to ensure that students can achieve moral excellence and have noble characters following Islamic teachings. However, education at Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, also teaches students to understand and live the world in a balanced way. The students are encouraged to become individuals who contribute both in the spiritual realm and in activities that benefit society. In this context, Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso strengthens the values of simplicity, social responsibility, and moral integrity as the basis for achieving the desired balance between the dimensions of spirituality and the needs of the world.

Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso emphasized the importance of maintaining a balance between individual independence and togetherness in the context of character building of students. This institution recognizes the values of autonomy as a crucial aspect of students' personal development, emphasizing the ability to take initiative, be responsible for their actions, and develop independently. However, Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, also highlights the importance of community life and cooperation. Students are taught

Integration of Wasatīyyah Values in the Curriculum at Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi

to understand that individual success is often closely related to the ability to interact harmoniously in their social environment. Therefore, they are empowered to be independent individuals and value and contribute to collective well-being, form mutually supportive relationships, and create an environment that promotes personal growth and healthy togetherness in a harmonious environment.

a. Five soul values

Five souls are the values instilled in all elements at Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, from the chaplains to the students. Five Souls is a way of thinking, attitudes, mentality, and behavior that all elements of Islamic boarding schools uphold. The five soul values include sincerity, simplicity, self-help, ukhuwah Isalmiyah (Islamic Brotherhood), and freedom.

The value of sincerity in the Islamic tradition refers to the concept of something done without any encouragement or motive to obtain specific results or benefits. This means that all the work done is intended based on worship and the desire to gain Allah's approval. In this way, the kiyai is sincere in educating, the kiyai's assistants are earnest in carrying out their mandate as educators, and the students are also willing to be educated. Therefore, all parties in the Islamic boarding school do not intend to make a profit, and the material rewards are all done to get Allah's approval. A sincere spirit creates a harmonious atmosphere in the boarding school where the kiyai is respected by the students, and they obey and love their kiyai. On this basis, students are ready to fight wherever and whenever they are and become people who are helpful to others.

In terms of sincerity, there is an exciting expression from K.H Ahmad Sahal, "Bondo bahu pikir lek perlu sak nyawane pisan." This expression suggests that sincerity and spiritual sacrifice regarding wealth, energy, and thoughts are necessary for fighting (Keane, 2002). This is totality in struggle; struggle without sacrifice is a big lie. The spirit of sincerity that exists covers all teacher activities, and the most important thing is that Kiyai is something that all students must know to become uswah Hashanah. With this example, it is possible to create an "inner order" and "thought system" so that the students are under the same education umbrella based on a soul and atmosphere of sincerity. So, it is not uncommon to see the motto written on the boarding school walls and often conveyed by the Kiyai at various events, that is, *al-Ikhlās rūh al amal* (sincerity is the soul of work). This is where the students continually echo the value of sincerity to create students who have a spirit of patriotism. Therefore, this sincere spirit is a must when carrying out all activities. Totality in action is the essence of sincerity.

The value of simplicity instilled through the five souls is a value that integrates the elements of strength, ability, and patience in facing struggles in life. However, behind this simplicity is a big heart, the courage to always move forward, and never attack in the face of difficulties. With this soul comes the character of hard work and never giving up as a preparation for future life struggles. In interpreting simplicity, Pondok Gontor will appreciate students who adhere firmly and are steadfast to the values they received at the Islamic boarding school. This is what the Islamic boarding school instills; this is in line with KH Imam Zarkasyi's statement that, according to him, "a great person for Gontor is willing to fight, even in a small prayer room in a remote village." On this basis, alums must be ready to fight wherever they are. Therefore, the spirit of simplicity in Gontor is instilled in the students through their daily way of life. They are advised not to overdo food, shelter, and clothing. Eating enough to meet the criteria for healthy and nutritious food doesn't need to be delicious daily; a place to live doesn't need a soft mattress but is sufficient and can be used to rest comfortably. You don't need to wear expensive clothes, just something that is pure and can cover your private parts. This is a simple hope from the founder that is full of meaning. So this means that being simple does not mean being destitute, but you can continue moving and fighting with all the conditions you have.

The value of independence at Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso, is instilled along with establishing a dormitory system. Like in Islamic boarding schools, the students learn to help themselves here. They are required to be able to fulfill their own needs. They even manage their own pocket money. A student organization called the Modern Boarding School Student Organization was formed in a broader scope. It aims to educate students so they can organize and think about other students' lives— from preparing their needs to enforcing discipline. Being independent only sometimes means that students can learn and care for themselves. But Islamic boarding schools as educational institutions must also be able to be independent so that they do not depend on other parties.

V. CONCLUSIONS

The integration of wasatīyyah values on the two sites, which have the same typology as modern Islamic boarding schools, integrates all wasatīyyah values based on the values mentioned by the Indonesian Ulema Council as the development of wasatīyyah values from Bogor Massage which consists of *Tawassuṭ*, *Tawāzun*, *I'tidāl*, *Tasāmuḥ*, *Musāwāh*, *Shūrā*, *Islāh*,

Integration of Wasatiyyah Values in the Curriculum at Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Central Sulawesi

Awlawiyyah, Taṭawwur wa ibtikār, and Tahaddur. The five soul values influence the integration of wasatiyyah values underlying life in Central Sulawesi's two modern Islamic boarding schools.

Integrating wasatiyyah values at both sites is carried out through four approaches: Contributionive-Cultural, integrated-intra-curricular, textual-additive, and contextually applicable. These four approaches are formulations of the integration approach by Banks: the contributions approach, The Additive Approach, The Transformation Approach, and The Social Action Approach. Wasatiyyah values are integrated into the curriculum on both sites through the Prescribed/intended curriculum, also called core curriculum and Hidden Curriculum. On-site 1 (Darussalam Gontor Modern Islamic Boarding School, Campus 11 Ittihadul Ummah Poso), another type of curriculum was found, namely: Tested curriculum, which consists of imtihān safety (oral exam) and imtihān tahrīri (written exam). These three types of curriculum are appropriate formulations found on both sites based on concepts in the framework of thought introduced by Daniel Schugurensky.

REFERENCES

- 1) Ainscow, M. (2005). Developing inclusive education systems: what are the levers for change? *Journal of Educational Change*, 6(2), 109-124. doi:10.1007/s10833-005-1298-4
- 2) Ali, N., Afwadzi, B., Abdullah, I., & Mukmin, M. I. (2021). Interreligious Literacy Learning as a Counter-Radicalization Method: A New Trend among Institutions of Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia. *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, 32(4), 383-405. doi:10.1080/09596410.2021.1996978
- 3) Clancy, S. L., & Holford, J. (2018). "Life-changing things happen". *Education + Training*, 60(6), 620-636. doi:10.1108/ET-03-2018-0069
- 4) Dalvi-Esfahani, M., Ramayah, T., & Rahman, A. A. (2017). Moderating role of personal values on managers' intention to adopt Green IS. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 117(3), 582-604. doi:10.1108/IMDS-02-2016-0049
- 5) Dubois, N., & Beauvois, J.-L. (2008). The Social Value of Internal Explanations and the Norm of Internality. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass*, 2(4), 1737-1752. doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-9004.2008.00126.x
- 6) Giddens, A. (2006). *Sociology*. London: Polity Press.
- 7) Keane, W. (2002). Sincerity, "Modernity," and the Protestants. *Cultural Anthropology*, 17(1), 65-92.
- 8) McShane, E. J. (1973). A Unified Theory of Integration. *The American Mathematical Monthly*, 80(4), 349-359. doi:10.1080/00029890.1973.11993291
- 9) Nurdin, N. (2016). Radicalism on Worl Wide Web and Propaganda Strategy *Al-Ulum*, 16(2).
- 10) Nurdin, N. (2018). Institutional Arrangements in E-Government Implementation and Use: A Case Study From Indonesian Local Government. *International Journal of Electronic Government Research (IJEGR)*, 14(2), 44-63. doi:10.4018/ijegr.2018040104
- 11) Nurdin, N., Scheepers, H., & Stockdale, R. (2022). A social system for sustainable local e-government. *Journal of Systems and Information Technology*, 24(1), 1-31. doi:10.1108/JSIT-10-2019-0214
- 12) Nurdin, N., Stockdale, R., & Scheepers, H. (2014). Coordination and Cooperation in E-Government: An Indonesian Local E-Government Case *The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in developing Countries*, 61(3), 1-21.
- 13) Saneian, Z. S., Tabataba'i-Nasab, S. M., Saeida Ardakani, S., & Khodadadi, M. (2023). Discovering Islamic values: a classical grounded theory approach. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 14(9), 2285-2305. doi:10.1108/JIMA-02-2022-0068
- 14) Silcock, P. (1996). Three Principles For A New Progressivism. *Oxford Review of Education*, 22(2), 199-216. doi:10.1080/0305498960220207
- 15) Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. M. (1998). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques* (2 ed.). California, USA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- 16) Supardi, S., Kuswaya, A., & Ridwan, M. K. (2023). Wasathiyah Islam In Local Language Commentaries In Indonesia: An Analysis Of Readers' Reception Of Sundanese, Javanese, And Malay. *Millati, Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities*, 8(1), 101-121.